Not Another Boring Informed Consent Lecture.

David J. Satin  MD  
Assistant Professor, Dept. Family Medicine & Community Health  
Post Doctoral Fellow, Center for Bioethics  
dsatin@umphysicians.umn.edu

Financial Conflicts of Interest

• None

Following this session, participants will be able to:

1. Describe the 3 elements of informed consent.
2. Explain the standard of care with regard to pediatric informed consent.
3. Cite the 7 Deadly Exceptions to confidentiality.

Case #1

Consent Forms

Is possible to have a discussion about consent forms for laser procedures and cone beam CT scans?

Informed Consent vs Informed Choice
A Hierarchy of Legally Defensible Consent Documentation

• Video with hostage-style newspaper dating
  – Form with personalized documentation
    • Personalized documentation in chart
      – Signed form in chart
        » "Consent" in chart

Now back to the question…

consent forms for laser procedures and cone beam CT scans?

Objective #1

Describe the 3 elements of informed consent.

Informed Consent Requires:

1. Full Disclosure
2. Capacity
3. Voluntariness

Full Disclosure

What would a reasonable person in this patient's position want to know?

What does a reasonable person want to know?

• Risks that are common or dangerous
• Often nothing until they disagree
• Sometimes a lot
How do you know what this person wants to know?

- Have a discussion (Two-way info exchange)
- “Ask, tell, ask”
- Q&A

Documenting Consent

1. Discussed indication for Rx
2. Discussed risks & benefits of Rx, no Rx, and alternative Rx, including...
3. Q & A period: x concerns discussed
4. Patient demonstrated understanding and appreciation of above info
5. Patient chose: y

Does mom get it?

- As you explain the risks and benefits of treatment, non-treatment, and alternative treatments to the mother of an 11 year old patient, you get the feeling she doesn’t really understand.
- You’re not sure whether it’s appropriate for her to be the one to consent even though it’s a straightforward case.

Informed Consent Requires:

1. Full Disclosure
2. Capacity
3. Voluntariness
Capacity

Does the patient understand and appreciate the risks and benefits of treatment, non-treatment, and alternative treatments to the level of the community standard?

Case #3

Mature Minor?

- 17 year old John wanted his braces off early and didn't want me to tell his parents even though they paid in full.
- He was living in an apartment and managing his own affairs and was estranged from them.
- He didn't tell me if it was an official court emancipation.
- Because of the Mature Minor statute, I took the braces off and did tell his parents, believing that he is in charge of his own body and decisions even though he was below the age of 18.
- He reluctantly agreed to allow us to inform his parents, and they agreed.

Mature Minor?

- BUT, an ethical dilemma COULD have occurred if he hadn't let me.
- Who is in charge of what to do with his body at this age - him or his parents?!!

The Money

- Some P4P program "bonuses" truly represent new funds while others represent a 3% "withhold" across the board from the current fee-for-service schedule.
- P4P reimbursements range from 3%-20% of a physician's fee-for-service reimbursements.
- Personal investigation of Minnesota's major insurers including Medica, HealthPartners, Blue Cross Blue Shield, UCare; interviews, internet search on insurance websites, and internal UMN DFMCH documents, 9/2005.
Mature Minor

Consent
Vs.
Confidentiality

Objective #2

Describe the standard of care with regard to pediatric informed consent.

Informed Consent for Minors

• “Does John have the capacity to understand and appreciate the benefits and burdens of the proposed treatment, non-treatment, and alternative treatments?”

• The law reflects morality.

Legally Consenting a Minor 1

A minor (< 18 y.o.) may legally consent if (s)he has the capacity to understand … AND

#1. (S)he fulfills one emancipated minor criterion:
- Lives separately from parent/guardian & manages own finances
- Is married
- Has borne a child

Legally Consenting a Minor 2

A minor (< 18 y.o.) may legally consent if (s)he has the capacity to understand … AND

#2. (S)he requests one of the following:
- Emergency care
- Contraceptive and Pregnancy related care
- STD diagnosis/treatment
- Alcohol or drug use evaluation
- Inpatient mental health treatment (> or = 16yo)

Legally Consenting a Minor 3

If #1 and #2 do not apply, the “Mature Minor” doctrine can be used, if all of the following criteria apply:
- Parental involvement is impractical or problematic
- Minor is 15 years of age or older
- Proposed treatment is for minor’s benefit
- Proposed treatment is deemed necessary
- Proposed treatment does not involve complex high-risk procedures/surgery.
Mature Minor?

- 17 year old John wanted his braces off early and didn't want me to tell his parents even though they paid in full.
- He was living in an apartment and managing his own affairs and was estranged from them.
- He didn't tell me if it was an official court emancipation.
- Because of the Mature Minor statute, I took the braces off and did tell his parents, believing that he is in charge of his own body and decisions even though he was below the age of 18.
- He reluctantly agreed to allow us to inform his parents, and they agreed.

Objective #3

Cite the 7 Deadly Exceptions to confidentiality.

The 7 Deadly Exceptions to Confidentiality

1. Suspected abuse (not assault)
2. Mandatory reporting laws: infections, fresh gunshot/stab
3. Court-orders
4. Duty to warn
5. Substitute decision-maker required
6. Insurance bill
7. In Minnesota, minors (<18) are subject to a clause allowing parental involvement if needed for the child’s safety
Following this session, participants will be able to:

1. Describe the 3 elements of informed consent.
2. Explain the standard of care with regard to pediatric informed consent.
3. Cite the 7 Deadly Exceptions to confidentiality.

Not Another Boring Informed Consent Lecture.

David J. Satin MD
Assistant Professor, Dept. Family Medicine & Community Health
Post Doctoral Fellow, Center for Bioethics
dsatin@umphysicians.umn.edu

Bonus Objective

What informed consent cannot do.

Bonus Case

Pontius Pilate Fallacy

Thirty years ago (when I was reluctant to say “no”) I agreed to single arch treatment for a child whose parents wanted to save expense.

Twice during the course of treatment I sat with the parents and advised that lower appliances should be placed to avoid a poor occlusal result.

Even though they continued to decline the additional work and knew its importance, they later threatened legal action when over a year later they decided they were not happy with the result.

Pontius Pilate Fallacy

- Be slow to compromise treatment at the patient’s request.
- Patients cannot give you permission to provide poor results.
- You cannot contract out of negligence.
The release of atomic energy has not created a new problem. It has merely made more urgent the necessity of solving an existing one.